

## Political Science 202W

Fall 2021

Lectures on Mondays and Wednesdays (and occasional Fridays), 10:25-11:15

Recitations on Thursdays or Fridays

### Argument in Political Science

Professor Gerald Gamm

Harkness Hall 319

Email: [gerald.gamm@rochester.edu](mailto:gerald.gamm@rochester.edu)

[Zoom](#) office hours (PSCI 202W only): Monday afternoons, 1:00-2:00

Additional [Zoom](#) office hours: Monday afternoons, 2:00-3:00

In-person office hours: Thursday mornings, 10:00-11:00

Recitation leaders: [Brett Behrend](#), [Jack Dippolito](#), [Blaine Doyle](#), [Morgan Gillespie](#), [Matthew Kiel](#), [Arielle Savoy](#), and [Jacob Walters](#)

**Books.** Six books are available for purchase in the campus bookstore and at various places online, including [AbeBooks](#) and [Amazon](#). *Be certain to get the correct translation of Tocqueville; our edition is translated by George Lawrence and edited by J. P. Mayer.* Some of these books are also available as electronic editions through Rush Rhees Library:

1. David Wootton, ed., *The Essential Federalist and Anti-Federalist Papers*.
2. Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, translated by George Lawrence.
3. John Aldrich, *Why Parties?: A Second Look* (2011).
4. Nancy Woloch, *Muller v. Oregon* (1996).
5. Ira Katznelson, *When Affirmative Action Was White* (2005).
6. John Judis, *The Populist Explosion* (2016).

**Course website.** Blackboard contains lots of information essential to the course—selected student papers (for discussion in recitation), links to all required readings not in the books listed above, and folders for uploading your papers each week. To access readings off-campus, you will need to download and run VPN (so that your computer can be viewed as part of the University's network). You can install VPN [here](#). *If any link on the website does not work, please let Professor Gamm know immediately by email.*

**Academic honesty.** Students must conduct themselves in accordance with the University's Academic Honesty Policy. In this class, students are encouraged to discuss readings and course material with anyone they choose—including the professor, TA's, and other students. But, unless all assignments have been submitted, they may not share, receive, or discuss written work for this class, including outlines, plans, and notes for papers, except with Writing Fellows acting in their official capacity. Under no circumstances may students receive help of any sort with their papers from current or former students in this class.

**Credit hours.** This course follows the College credit hour policy for four-credit courses. This course meets three times weekly for three hours per week. For the fourth credit hour, students should review the student papers in advance of recitation. This course also includes substantial reading and writing assignments, as well as a final exam.

## Requirements

Class participation is worth 20% of your grade. You are expected to attend lectures and recitations on a regular basis. The baseline participation grade is determined by participation in recitations, though it may be boosted by especially constructive contributions during lecture. *You must attend recitation on a regular basis to receive credit for the course.*

Short papers and the final exam are worth the remaining 80% of your grade.

**To receive credit for the course, you must attend recitation on a regular basis, submit at least five papers (according to the schedule below), and take the final exam. Anyone who does not fulfill these minimal requirements will not receive credit for the course.** The final exam schedule is set by the registrar and will be announced early this semester. You must be in Rochester to take the exam in person, so please wait to confirm the date before making any travel arrangements.

You must write between five and eleven papers and write them on a regular basis throughout the semester. The paper units are grouped into pairs/triplets, as follows:

- Paper 1: Unit B or C
- Paper 2: Unit D or E
- Paper 3: Unit F or H
- Paper 4: Unit I or J
- Paper 5: Unit K, L, or M

### **You must write at least one paper from each of the five groupings listed above.\***

You must submit at least five papers (according to this schedule) to receive credit for the course. If you write exactly five papers, all five grades count. If you write between six and nine papers, we drop the lowest grade. If you write ten or eleven papers, we drop the two lowest grades. Should you wish to count every paper grade, you may do so if you notify your teaching assistant by e-mail before the final exam. *The number of papers you write determines the relative weight of your papers and final exam.* These are the various weightings:

Five or six papers (five paper grades) . . . . .	45% papers, 35% final exam
Seven papers (six paper grades) . . . . .	50% papers, 30% final exam
Eight papers (seven paper grades) . . . . .	55% papers, 25% final exam
Nine or ten papers (eight paper grades) . . . . .	60% papers, 20% final exam
Eleven papers (nine paper grades) . . . . .	65% papers, 15% final exam

Keep papers short and to the point. Papers should be 700-1,000 words in length (about 2-3 pages). *No paper may exceed 1,000 words.* Double-space the papers, use 12-point font, and no funny stuff with the margins; an inch on each side is about right. Place your recitation leader's name at the top of your paper.

**All papers are due in that week's Blackboard assignment folder no later than 1:00 p.m. on Tuesdays.** Requests for extensions will be granted only on a rare, case-by-case basis; except in the case of a genuine and unforeseen emergency, no late papers will be accepted without prior permission. If you do need an extension, contact your recitation leader or Professor Gamm as early as possible.

In the first weeks of the semester, three anonymous student papers will be posted to the course website each Wednesday evening. You are responsible for reading those three anonymous papers as preparation for your recitation on Thursday or Friday; you should copy those papers and bring the copies with you to recitation. Although we will continue posting selected student papers in later weeks, they are intended for reference purposes only; they will not be discussed in recitation.

\* THE FINE PRINT: If you skip one pair of units, you will receive a "0" as one of your paper grades, and this "0" may not be dropped. If you skip two pairs of units, you will receive *two* paper grades of "0," and these grades may not be dropped. *You may not skip more than two pairs of units and still receive credit for the course. Whether or not you skip any pairs of units, you still must write five serious papers to receive credit for the course.*

### **Unit A—Parchment Barriers**

Aug. 25      Lecture

Aug. 27      Discussion: Special class on how to write effective, strong papers  
*Prepare by reading The Federalist No. 84, first twelve paragraphs, and Madison/Jefferson letters*

*No paper assignment.*

[Declaration of Independence](#), 4 July 1776.

Stacy Schiff, "[The Boston Tea Party Was More Than That. It Was a Riot](#)," *New York Times*, 13 Aug. 2020. [Text version](#)

Jeffrey Ostler, "[The Shameful Final Grievance of the Declaration of Independence](#)," *The Atlantic*, 8 Feb. 2020.

[Constitution of the United States](#), 1787.

[The Federalist No. 84](#), first twelve paragraphs (ending with the words ". . . entirely foreign from the substance of the thing."), 1788. Also in David Wootton, ed., *Essential Federalist*, 301-6.

James Madison to Thomas Jefferson, [Letter](#), 17 Oct. 1788.

Thomas Jefferson to James Madison, [Letter](#), 15 Mar. 1789.

Bill of Rights, 1791. [First ten amendments to the Constitution of the United States](#).

### **Unit B—Representation**

Aug. 30      Lecture

Sept. 1      Lecture

Sept. 2/3    Recitation

*Paper due Aug. 31.* In *The Federalist* No. 35, Hamilton writes that "the idea of an actual representation of all classes of the people by persons of each class is altogether visionary." How do Madison and Hamilton (writing in *The Federalist*), Melancton Smith (an Anti-Federalist), and Edmund Burke define effective representation? Does recent scholarship—by Butler and Broockman, and by Betz, Fortunato, and O'Brien—support the view of any particular side in this debate?

*The Federalist* Nos. 35, 55, and 57, in David Wootton, ed., *Essential Federalist*.

Melancton Smith, speeches before the New York Ratifying Convention, 20-23 June 1788, in David Wootton, ed., *Essential Federalist*, 42-58.

Edmund Burke, [Speech to the Electors of Bristol, England](#), 3 Nov. 1774.

Daniel M. Butler and David E. Broockman, "[Do Politicians Racially Discriminate against Constituents? A Field Experiment on State Legislators](#)," *American Journal of Political Science* 55 (2011), 463-77.

Timm Betz, David Fortunato, and Diana Z. O'Brien, "[Women's Descriptive Representation and Gendered Import Tax Discrimination](#)," *American Political Science Review* 115 (2021), 307-15.

### **Unit C—Institutional Design**

Sept. 6        No class—Labor Day  
Sept. 8        No class—Rosh Hashanah  
Sept. 10       Lecture  
Sept. 13       Lecture  
Sept. 15       Lecture  
Sept. 16/17   Recitation

*Paper due Sept. 14.* What is the greatest threat—or threats—to free government, according to *The Federalist* (Madison and Hamilton), the Anti-Federalists (Brutus and Agrippa), and Calhoun, and what institutional features does each set of writers propose to counter these threats? Also, drawing on Rosen and on Haidt and Rose-Stockwell, consider whether Madison, who wrote passionately about factions and the virtues of an extensive republic, would be satisfied with the state of American politics today.

*The Federalist* Nos. 10, 48, 51, 62, and 63 in David Wootton, ed., *Essential Federalist*.

[Brutus I](#), 18 Oct. 1787.

[Agrippa IV](#), 3 Dec. 1787.

John C. Calhoun, excerpt from [A Disquisition on Government](#).

Jeffrey Rosen, "[America Is Living James Madison's Nightmare](#)," *The Atlantic*, Oct. 2018.

Jonathan Haidt and Tobias Rose-Stockwell, "[The Dark Psychology of Social Networks](#)," *The Atlantic*, Dec. 2019.

### **Unit D—Freedom, Slavery, and the Union**

Sept. 20       Lecture  
Sept. 22       Lecture  
Sept. 23/24   Recitation

*Paper due Sept. 21.* Have slavery and racism been inherent in the American political system or are they instead alien to the founding principles of the country? Analyze how each of these readings answers this question.

William Lloyd Garrison, "[On the Constitution and the Union](#)," *The Liberator*, 29 Dec. 1832, and "[The American Union](#)," *The Liberator*, 10 Jan. 1845.

Frederick Douglass, "[What to the Slave Is the Fourth of July?](#)" Rochester, N.Y., 5 July 1852.

Jeannie Suk Gersen, "[The Importance of Teaching Dred Scott](#)," *The New Yorker*, 8 Jun. 2021.

Stephen A. Douglas and Abraham Lincoln, [Seventh Debate](#), Alton, Ill., 15 Oct. 1858.

Henry L. Benning, [address to the Virginia State Convention](#), 1861.

Nikole Hannah-Jones, "[Our Democracy's Founding Ideals Were False When They Were Written. Black Americans Have Fought To Make Them True](#)," The 1619 Project, *New York Times*, 14 Aug. 2019, 14-26. [Text version](#)

Sean Wilentz, "[A Matter of Facts](#)," *The Atlantic*, 22 Jan. 2020.

Leslie M. Harris, "[I Helped Fact-Check the 1619 Project. The Times Ignored Me](#)," *Politico*, 6 Mar. 2020.

***Unit E—Social Choice and the Origins of American Political Parties***

Sept. 27           Lecture  
Sept. 29           Lecture  
Sept. 30/Oct. 1   Recitation

*Paper due Sept. 28.* Why did politicians invent parties, and what advantages come from two-party competition? In answering this question, be sure to consider Aldrich’s account of the rise of Federalists and Republicans in the 1790s, including his use of social choice theory, alongside the work of Bucchianeri and of Gamm and Kousser.

John Aldrich, *Why Parties?*, 3-43, 67-101.

Peter Bucchianeri, “[Party Competition and Coalitional Stability: Evidence from American Local Government](#),” *American Political Science Review* 114 (2020), 1055-70.

Gerald Gamm and Thad Kousser, “[Life, Literacy, and the Pursuit of Prosperity: Party Competition and Policy Outcomes in 50 States](#),” *American Political Science Review*, forthcoming.

***Unit F—Democratic Tyranny***

Oct. 4           Lecture  
Oct. 6           Lecture  
Oct. 7/8        Recitation

*Paper due Oct. 5.* “The human heart,” Tocqueville warns, “nourishes a debased taste for equality, which leads the weak to want to drag the strong down to their level and which induces men to prefer equality in servitude to inequality in freedom.” What are the specific concerns that Tocqueville sees emerging, in both the political and social spheres, from widespread equality? What are the principal dangers he identifies as threats to human liberty?

Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, ed. J. P. Mayer and transl. George Lawrence, xiii-xiv, 9-20, 50-60, 173, 196-99, 226-35, 246-61, 433-36, 465-74, 503-9, 535-41, 667-79, 690-705.

***Unit G—Democratic Liberty***

Oct. 11        *No class—Fall Break*  
Oct. 13        Lecture  
Oct. 15        Lecture

*No paper assignment.*

Alexis de Tocqueville, *Democracy in America*, ed. J. P. Mayer and transl. George Lawrence, 61-72, 87-98, 189-95, 235-45, 262-76, 286-94, 301-11, 395-400, 509-28, 604-5.

### ***Unit H—Voters***

Oct. 18      Lecture  
Oct. 20      Lecture  
Oct. 21/22    Recitation

*Paper due Oct. 19.* What institutions and strategies have been used either to mobilize new voters or to drive existing voters out of the political system? And what tools have disenfranchised Americans developed to exert political influence and to fight for full voting rights?

John Aldrich, *Why Parties?*, 30-32, 43-50, 102-29.

Paula Baker, "[The Domestication of Politics: Women and American Political Society, 1780-1920](#)," *American Historical Review* 89 (1984), 620-47.

Mary Hershberger, "[Mobilizing Women, Anticipating Abolition: The Struggle against Indian Removal in the 1830s](#)," *Journal of American History* 86 (1999), 15-40.

J. Morgan Kousser, "[Post-Reconstruction Suffrage Restrictions in Tennessee: A New Look at the V. O. Key Thesis](#)," *Political Science Quarterly* 88 (1973), 655-83.

Willard Hughes Rollings, "[Citizenship and Suffrage: The Native American Struggle for Civil Rights in the American West, 1830–1965](#)," *Nevada Law Journal* 5 (2004), 126-40.

### ***Unit I—Immigrants***

Oct. 25      Lecture  
Oct. 27      Lecture  
Oct. 28/29    Recitation

*Paper due Oct. 26.* What was the relationship between the organization of the Know Nothings, the collapse of the Whigs, and the rise of the Republican party in the 1850s? And what have been the sources—and legislative consequences—of nativist sentiment throughout U.S. history? In answering this question, be sure to draw on all assigned readings.

John Aldrich, *Why Parties?*, 50-56, 130-59.

Michael F. Holt, "[The Politics of Impatience: The Origins of Know Nothingism](#)," *Journal of American History* 60 (1973), 309-31.

Erika Lee, "[The Chinese Exclusion Example: Race, Immigration, and American Gatekeeping, 1882-1924](#)," *Journal of American Ethnic History* 21 (2002), 36-62.

Henry Cabot Lodge, "[The Restriction of Immigration](#)," *North American Review* 152: 410 (Jan. 1891), 27-36.

R. Michael Alvarez and Tara L. Butterfield, "[The Resurgence of Nativism in California? The Case of Proposition 187 and Illegal Immigration](#)," *Social Science Quarterly* 81 (2000), 167-79.

**Unit J— Women and Labor**

Nov. 1       Lecture  
Nov. 3       Lecture  
Nov. 4/5     Recitation

*Paper due Nov. 2.* What arguments, debates, and legal strategies culminated in the Supreme Court ruling in *Muller v. Oregon* and the passage of Title VII? How important was Title VII and the case *Reed v. Reed* in challenging the gender-based discrimination embodied in *Muller v. Oregon*?

Nancy Woloch, *Muller v. Oregon*, 1-83, 93-107, 108-33 (skim), 133-50.

Jo Freeman, "[How 'Sex' Got Into Title VII: Persistent Opportunism as a Maker of Public Policy](#)," *Law and Inequality* 9 (1991), 163-84.

Jeffrey Toobin, "[Heavyweight: How Ruth Bader Ginsburg Has Moved the Supreme Court](#)," *The New Yorker*, 11 Mar. 2013.

**Unit K— Race and Public Policy**

Nov. 8       Lecture  
Nov. 10     Lecture  
Nov. 11/12   Recitation

*Paper due Nov. 9.* What were the political forces in the mid-20th-century Congress that shaped welfare policy, labor legislation, and benefits for veterans? How did governments also help shape residential patterns and mass incarceration?

Ira Katznelson, *When Affirmative Action Was White*, 12-79, 113-41.

Ta-Nehisi Coates, "[The Case for Reparations](#)," *Atlantic Monthly*, June 2014.

James Forman, Jr., "[Racial Critiques of Mass Incarceration: Beyond the New Jim Crow](#)," *New York University Law Review* 87 (2012), 21-69.

### **Unit L—Congress, Parties, and the Culture War**

Nov. 15      Lecture  
Nov. 17      Lecture  
Nov. 18/19   Recitation

*Paper due Nov. 16.* Shepsle writes that “Congress is an arena for constituencies, committees, and [party] coalitions.” Examining major developments in the House and Senate from the 1890s to today, analyze how the powers of party leaders have changed—and how these changes have related to the strength and unity of their party coalitions as well as the role of committee chairs.

Joseph Cooper and David W. Brady, “[Institutional Context and Leadership Style: The House from Cannon to Rayburn](#),” *American Political Science Review* 75 (1981), 411-25.

Kenneth A. Shepsle, “[The Changing Textbook Congress](#),” 238-66 in *Can the Government Govern?*, eds. John E. Chubb and Paul E. Peterson (Washington, D.C.: Brookings, 1989).

Jonathan Rauch, “[How American Politics Went Insane](#),” *The Atlantic*, July/Aug. 2016, 50-63.

Gerald Gamm and Steven S. Smith, [Steering the Senate: Party Organization and the Emergence of Leadership, 1789-2021](#) (manuscript), chap. 9.

### **Unit M— The Populist Revolt**

Nov. 22      Lecture  
Nov. 24      No class—Thanksgiving Break  
Nov. 26      No class—Thanksgiving Break  
Nov. 29      Lecture  
Dec. 1        Lecture  
Dec. 2/3     Recitation

*Paper due Nov. 30.* What changes in the American political system explain Donald Trump’s success in winning the presidency in 2016, Bernie Sanders’s strong challenges in both 2016 and 2020, and Trump’s enduring influence over the Republican party? What concerns do scholars have about these changes in the political system?

John Judis, *The Populist Explosion*.

Frances E. Lee, “[Populism and the American Party System: Opportunities and Constraints](#),” *Perspectives on Politics* 18 (2020), 370-88.

Jonathan Rauch and Ray La Raja, “[Too Much Democracy Is Bad for Democracy](#),” *The Atlantic*, Dec. 2019.

Ross Douthat, “[Win or Lose, Trump Will Hold Power Over the G.O.P.](#),” *New York Times*, 22 Aug. 2020. [Text version](#)

“[What Trump Got Right](#),” *Washington Post*, 30 July 2021.

**Unit N— The 2020 Election and the Attack on the United States Capitol**

Dec. 6           Lecture

Dec. 8           Lecture/Discussion

*No paper assignment.*

Mitt Romney, [speech on election night](#), 6 Nov. 2012, first 1:08 of speech.

Hillary Clinton, [speech the day following the election](#), 9 Nov. 2016.

Donald J. Trump, [video statement on Capitol protestors](#), 6 Jan. 2021.

Steven Levitsky and Daniel Ziblatt, "[How Wobbly Is Our Democracy?](#)" *New York Times*, 27 Jan. 2018.

Yoni Appelbaum, "[How America Ends](#)," *The Atlantic*, Dec. 2019.

Nate Cohn, "[Why Political Sectarianism Is a Growing Threat to American Democracy](#)," *New York Times*, 19 Apr. 2021.

David A. Graham, "[The Insurrection Was Just Part of the Plot](#)," *The Atlantic*, 30 July 2021.

Jess Bidgood, "[They Kept the Wheels on Democracy as Trump Tried To Steal an Election. Now They're Paying the Price](#)," *Boston Globe*, 3 July 2021.

Tim Alberta, "[The Senator Who Decided To Tell the Truth](#)," *The Atlantic*, 30 June 2021.

["Statement of Concern: The Threats to American Democracy and the Need for National Voting and Election Administration Standards,"](#) 1 June 2021.

Steven Levitsky and Daniel Ziblatt, "[The Biggest Threat to Democracy Is the GOP Stealing the Next Election](#)," *The Atlantic*, 9 July 2021.

Catie Edmondson, "[Cheney Embraces Her Downfall, Warning G.O.P. of Trump in a Fiery Speech](#)," *New York Times*, 11 May 2021. [Text version](#)

Liz Cheney, [Opening Statement for the January 6 Capitol Riot Hearing](#), 27 July 2021.