# History 382W/482. Apocalypse Now . . . and Then: A History of Apocalyptic Thought

Thursdays, 2:00-4:40
Bausch & Lomb 106
Professor Laura A. Smoller
office: Rush Rhees 369A
office hours: T 10-12 and by
appointment (via Zoom)

email: <u>laura.smoller@rochester.edu</u>



This seminar examines the history of beliefs about the end of the world in the western Judeo-Christian tradition. We will examine such topics as the birth of apocalyptic thought, the medieval development of various aspects of traditions about the End (such as the figure of Antichrist and millenarian traditions), apocalyptic influences on Europeans' initial contact with and colonization of the New World, millennial movements of the last two centuries (such as the Millerites and the Mormons), and contemporary apocalyptic scenarios. A major theme of the course will be the flexibility of apocalyptic language, its ability to interpret various historical situations, and its power to move people to acceptance or action.



Week 1. August 27. Introduction to the course and assignments; overview of the history of apocalyptic thought

This week will introduce students to the course, its format, and the semester's assignments. In addition, a lecture will offer an overview of the history of apocalyptic thought and movements, from biblical times through to the present day. The assigned reading (which, this week only, may be completed after class) offers a similar overview, also addressing the development of scholarship about apocalypticism (up to the year 1999, when Grafton's article was originally published).

Research: Finding a topic; beginning research.

#### Reading:

Anthony Grafton, "From the Stacks: The Millennia-Old History of the Apocalypse," *The New Republic*, July 15, 2014 (originally published November 8, 1999), <a href="http://www.newrepublic.com/article/118702/anthony-grafton-left-behind-and-apocalyptic-thinking">http://www.newrepublic.com/article/118702/anthony-grafton-left-behind-and-apocalyptic-thinking</a>.

For further exploration: PBS Frontline, "Apocalypse!" (series originally airing in 1999), <a href="http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/apocalypse/">http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/apocalypse/</a>.



#### Week 2. September 3. Early apocalyptic

This week's readings explore the apocalyptic strains in Judaism that would spill over into early Christianity, taking as example the book of Daniel. Daniel 7-12 is a classic example of the literary genre apocalypse, a type of writing that includes the disclosure of divine secrets in written form; the use of symbolic language, with dramatic, highly visual descriptions; a threefold pattern of crisis—judgment—salvation; pseudonymous authorship; and the incorporation of *ex eventu* prophecies (history disguised as prophecy). Reading Daniel will help demonstrate the elements of the genre, as well as the way in which such texts could speak to contemporary concerns, as it contains thinly disguised references to events surrounding the time of its composition.

Research: Identifying secondary sources through specialized databases. (Special session with Lara Nicosia, history resource specialist, via Zoom, 3:45-4:40 p.m.)

#### Reading for this week's discussion (please read in the order listed):

Eugen Weber, *Apocalypses: Prophecies, Cults, and Millennial Beliefs through the Ages* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999), 1-26;

Bernard McGinn, Visions of the End: Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages, Columbia Records of Civilization, 96 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1979), 1-14;

Daniel, in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible*, 5<sup>th</sup> ed (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2018), with the introduction by Amy C. Merrill Willis (at pp. 1249-50).

Optional for undergraduates (but incredibly useful): Casey Starnes, "Ancient Visions: The Roots of Judeo-Christian Apocalypse," in *End of Days: Essays on the Apocalypse from Antiquity to Modernity*, ed. Karolyn Kinane and Michael A. Ryan (Jefferson, NC: McFarland and Company, 2009), 27-46 (ER). Required for graduate students.

Recommended additional reading for graduate students: 2 Esdras (= 4 Ezra) 3, 5:1-18, 7:1-35, 11-14, in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible*.

<u>Discussion assignment:</u> Comment on the book of Daniel, our major reading for the week, using Perusall. Post at least four comments (or replies) and two questions. Feel free to bring in insights from the secondary readings (Weber, McGinn, and Starnes). All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, September 2.

Research assignment: Submit on Blackboard by Wednesday, September 2, at 11:59 p.m. a brief (1-2 sentence) description of a potential research topic. (Your thoughts can be quite vague at this point, but a preliminary sense of your interests will help Lara Nicosia to tailor her demonstration to your research interests.)



# Week 3. September 10. New Testament apocalyptic

For all Christians, the starting point for speculations about the end of the world is found in Scripture. Amongst canonical Christian texts, the most important is the book of Revelation (Apocalypse) of John, written sometime in the late first century C.E., with not-so-veiled references to the Roman emperors. Other important information comes in the so-called "Little Apocalypse" found in the gospels of Matthew, Mark, and Luke. These texts, along with the Book of Daniel, provide the basis around which later authors developed their own apocalyptic scenarios. As you read these texts, think about what is there and what isn't there (from any preconceptions you may have about the Christian view of Armageddon). How might the original audience have interpreted these books to give meaning to their own times? Who or what is being critiqued here?

Research: Locating and working with primary sources. (Special session with Anna Siebach-Larsen, Robbins Library, and Andrea Reithmayr, Rare Books and Special Collections, 3:00-4:40 p.m., via Zoom.)

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Weber, Apocalypses, 40-44;

Bernard McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality* (New York: Paulist Press, 1979), 1-16; Adela Yarbro Collins, "The Book of Revelation," in *The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism*, I: The Origins of Apocalypticism in Judaism and Christianity, ed. John J. Collins (New York: Continuum, 1998) 384-414 (ER);

Matthew 24-25; Mark 13; Luke 21; 2 Thessalonians 2; Revelation (complete), with introduction by Jean-Pierre Ruiz (at pp. 2203-05), in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible*.

<u>Discussion assignment</u>: Comment on the New Testament readings (Matthew, Mark, Luke, 2 Thessalonians, and Revelation) using Perusall. Post at least two comments, questions, or replies to others on each of the shorter passages, and at least four comments (or replies) and two questions on the Book of Revelation, our major reading for the week. Feel free to bring in insights from the secondary readings (Weber, McGinn, and Collins). All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, September 9.

Research assignment: Submit the following on Blackboard by Wednesday, September 9, at 11:59 pm:

- 1) a properly-formatted bibliography entry for a chapter or encyclopedia article relating to a potential research topic chosen from a volume on the list of "Encyclopedias and helpful essay collections" on the list "Some Resources to Get you Started,"
  - 2) a possible research question suggested by your reading of that chapter or article,
- 3) at least one primary source mentioned in that chapter or article (or that you have located in some other way). If that source is written in a language you do not read, please note whether the author of your chapter or article mentions a translation into a language you can read.



Students should schedule an individual conference with the instructor this week or next.



The assignment to write your own apocalypse, with commentary (for undergraduates) must be submitted on Blackboard by 11:59 p.m. on Sunday, September 13. (See instructions under Assignments and Papers on Blackboard.)

Graduate students instead will submit a book review (1000-1250 words) of a monograph relating to their research interests.



#### Week 4. September 17. Millenarians and anti-millenarians of the patristic period

Most early Christians assumed that they were living near the end of time, but interpreters disagreed over whether that End was imminent or centuries away. Controversy also raged over the notion that the end would be preceded by a reign of peace on earth. As you read the church fathers' thoughts on these topics, consider how they are interpreting the scriptural tradition. What other sorts of sources are they bringing to bear upon their considerations of the end? Richard Landes's studies of chronological systems and his concept of "owls" and "roosters" provide an intriguing scholarly approach to this topic. What use does he make of sources? What can we learn from what authors do not say?

Research: Initial presentations: scholarly encyclopedia article/book chapter, primary source.

Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Weber, *Apocalypses*, 27-40; 45-47;

McGinn, Visions of the End, 14-18, 25-27;

Richard Landes, "Owls, Roosters, and Apocalyptic Time: A Historical Method for Reading a Refractory Documentation," *Union Seminary Quarterly Review* 49 (1995): 49-69 (ER);

Irenaeus, Against Heresies, book V, chaps. 25-26, 28, 30, 32-34, selections (ER);

Lactantius, from *Divine Institutes*, in McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality* 17-28, 55-80 (that is, skip VII.2-13, at pages 28-54);

Augustine, *City of God*, book XVIII, chaps. 52-54 only; book XX, chaps. 7, 8, 11-13, 19, 23, and 30 (selections) only (ER);

Graduate students should also read: Richard Landes, "Lest the Millennium be Fulfilled: Apocalyptic Expectations and the Pattern of Western Chronography, 100-800 CE," in W. Verbeke, D. Verhelst, and A. Welkenhuysen, eds., *The Use and Abuse of Eschatology in the Middle Ages* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 1988), 137-211 (ER);

and, rebutting Landes's arguments: James Palmer, "Calculating Time and the End of Time in the Carolingian World, c. 740-c. 820," *English Historical Review* 129, no. 523 (2011): 1307-31 (ER).

<u>Discussion assignment</u>: Comment on the selections from Irenaeus, Lactantius, and Augustine, using Perusall. Post at least three comments, questions, or replies to others on each of these three readings. Feel free to bring in insights from the secondary readings (Weber, McGinn, and Landes). All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, September 16.

<u>Research assignment:</u> Make a brief presentation in which you share with the class a primary source on which you hope to work, as well as a potential research question drawn from your reading of your encyclopedia article or book chapter.



#### Week 5. September 24. The Last World Emperor and the Muslim enemy

Part of the power of apocalyptic language is the way in which it can be adapted to symbolic reinterpretation. This week's readings show us how late antique and medieval authors adapted the End time cast of characters in terms of their own times. As the Roman Empire became Christianized, new apocalyptic roles were envisioned for Augustus's (and Nero's) successors. And, with the rise of Islam and major conquests by Arab forces in lands of the old Roman empire, the eschatological scenario had to be adjusted to incorporate a major new adversary. The texts attributed to the Tiburtine Sibyl and to the third-century martyr Methodius (hence the appellation pseudo-Methodius) were among the most widely read eschatological works throughout the Middle Ages and into the early modern period. This fact should remind us that texts have a history apart from the milieux in which they were composed.

Research: Diagramming one's research for creative brainstorming.

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

McGinn, Visions of the End, 18-25, 28-36;

Weber, Apocalypses, 83-98;

"The Tiburtine Sibyl," in McGinn, Visions of the End, 43-50;

pseudo-Methodius, *Apocalypse* [also known as *Revelationes*], in *Apocalypse, Pseudo-Methodius. An Alexandrian World Chronicle*, ed. and trans. Benjamin Garstad, Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2012), vii-xviii; 75-139 (odd pages only) (ER);

Graduate students should also read: Stephen J. Shoemaker, *The Apocalypse of Empire: Imperial Eschatology in Late Antiquity and Early Islam* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2018), ch. 2, pp. 38-63 (ER).

<u>Discussion assignment:</u> Comment on the selections from the Tiburtine Sibyl and on the Latin pseudo-Methodius, using Perusall. Post at least two comments, questions, or replies to others on the Tiburtine Sibyl and at least four comments or replies to others and at least two questions on pseudo-Methodius. Feel free to bring in insights from the secondary readings (Weber, McGinn, and Shoemaker). All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, September 23.

Research assignment: Make a presentation to the class in which you share a diagram or mind-map of your research project as it stands thus far. (These presentations will take place this week and next week.) Diagrams (hand drawn is fine!) should be posted on Blackboard by noon on September 24. If you wish to present a diagram in the format of a mind-map, there are several free applications available to help you do so, e.g., <a href="https://app.mindmup.com/map/new/1596730702594">https://app.mindmup.com/map/new/1596730702594</a>.



# Week 6. October 1. Antichrist, apocalypse, and the church reform movement of the high Middle Ages

An evolving Antichristology (to match theologians' Christology) saw medieval authors elaborating on a handful of scriptural passages to flesh out the career of an Antichrist, a powerful adversary with whom Jesus Christ would have to battle in the Last Days. (The term "Antichrist" appears only four times in scripture: 1 John 2:18, 1 John 2:22, 1 John 4:3, and 2 John 1:7. Daniel, Revelation, and 2 Thessalonians represent other important sources.) This process resulted in the first full-blown biography of Antichrist, by the tenth-century reformist Cluniac monk Adso of Montier-en-Der, a work drawn upon by numerous later authors. The language and imagery of Antichrist (and Last World Emperor), as we will see in this week's readings, could also be harnessed for political ends, whether in service of a single political dynasty or as propaganda in the pope-emperor struggles unleashed by the church reform movement.

Research: Diagramming one's research for creative brainstorming, continued.

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Adso of Montier-en-Der, "Letter on Origin and Time of Antichrist," in McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality*, 81-96;

Richard K. Emmerson, "The Representation of Antichrist in Hildegard of Bingen's *Scivias*: Image, Word, Commentary, and Visionary Experience," *Gesta* 41, no. 2 (2002): 95-110 (ER);

Hildegard of Bingen, *Scivias*, Eleventh Vision of the Third Part, in Hildegard of Bingen, *Scivias*, trans. Mother Columba Hart and Jane Bishop; introduction by Barbara J. Newman; preface by Caroline Walker Bynum, 491-513 (ER).

Graduate students should also read: Michael A. Ryan, "Antichrist in the Middle Ages: *Plus ça change . . .*," *History Compass* 7/6 (2009): 1581-92 (ER);

Bernard McGinn, "Portraying Antichrist in the Middle Ages," in *The Use and Abuse of Eschatology*, 1-48 (ER).

<u>Discussion assignment:</u> Write a 250-500 word (500-1000 words for graduate students) response to the assigned readings. Your response should address all assigned readings, offering a very brief summary of the readings and noting both salient points you find worthy of discussion and questions raised by the readings. You should quote from both the assigned primary sources (Adso and Hildegard)—not the editors' introductions to these texts—to support your points. Responses are due (on Blackboard) by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, September 30.

<u>Research assignment:</u> Make a presentation to the class in which you diagram your research project as it stands thus far. (This week and last week.) Diagrams (hand drawn is fine!) should have be posted on Blackboard by noon on September 24.



#### Week 7. October 8. Apocalyptic rhetoric and the Crusades

Apocalyptic rhetoric (including discussions of Antichrist and the Last World Emperor) proved to have an irresistible propaganda value. Our two readings this week show the flexibility of that language. Jay Rubenstein's article, taking up themes from his book *Armies of Heaven: The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse* (New York: Basic Books, 2011), argues that First Crusade (1095-99) was understood by participants (and observers) as inherently apocalyptic. Philippe Buc's essay shows that an apocalyptic worldview could equally serve to support or to condemn crusading. Their essays both lead us to ponder as well to what extent eschatology propelled current events (in addition to sharpening political rhetoric). They also will offer us a vehicle with which to examine other scholars at work. Think about the ways in which each historian analyzes primary sources to make an argument and situates his thesis within a larger scholarly conversation about the topic.

Research: Close readings of primary sources.

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Jay Rubenstein, "Lambert of Saint-Omer and the Apocalyptic First Crusade," in Remembering the Crusades: Myth, Image, and Identity, ed. Nicholas Paul and Suzanne Yaeger (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012), 69-98 (ER);

Philippe Buc, "Crusade and Eschatology: Holy War Fostered and Inhibited," *Mitteilungen des Instituts für Österreichische Geschichtsforschung* 125 (2017): 304-339 (ER).

<u>Discussion assignment:</u> Comment on the two assigned articles, using Perusall. Post at least four comments, questions, or replies to others on each article. All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, October 7.

<u>Research assignment:</u> Make a presentation (this week or next week) offering a close reading of a key passage or passages from a primary source. Post a copy of your passage on Blackboard by noon on October 8.



Prospectus for the research paper must be submitted to Blackboard by 11:59 p.m. on October 11. (See instructions posted on Blackboard under Assignments and Papers).



Week 8. October 15. Joachim of Fiore: Prophecy as history; history as prophecy

Beginning in the twelfth century, a number of scholars have argued, a major shift in apocalyptic thinking occurred, as commentators applied a historical approach to the interpretation of Revelation. The central figure in this new interpretation of the apocalypse was the Calabrian abbot Joachim of Fiore, whose ideas, scholars long claimed, provided a means for a revival of millenarian aspirations that had lain dormant since the time of Augustine. (More recent scholars have disputed this contention on a number of grounds.) For Joachim, prophecy (especially the Book of Revelation) became a means of ordering the past, and history a way of thinking about the future. His powerful prediction of the appearance of new spiritual men was quickly seized upon by the beleaguered Spiritual wing of the new Franciscan order, while his promise of "one pastor, one flock" in the upcoming Third Age (or Third *status*) fueled dreams of a united Christian empire.

Research: Close reading of primary sources, continued.

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Weber, Apocalypses, 52-60;

Brett Whalen, *Dominion of God: Christendom and Apocalypse in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2009), 100-24, 270-79 (ER);

"Joachim of Fiore," in McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality*, 97-148; McGinn, *Visions of the End*, sections 17 (Joachim of Fiore), 19 (The Joachite Movement before 1260), and 24 (The Franciscan Spirituals).

Discussion assignment: This week's discussion assignment will make use of Blackboard's discussion board. Choose one quotation or passage from each of the primary texts listed below that you would like to discuss with the class. Post your quotation (please include page numbers), along with a brief (1-2 sentence) explanation of why you chose that particular passage or quotation. Feel free to bring in insights from Weber and Whalen. All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, October 14. Texts for which to choose quotations: Joachim of Fiore, "The Book of Concordance" (Selection C in *Apocalyptic Spirituality*), "The Seven-Headed Dragon" (Selection D in *Apocalyptic Spirituality*), "The Twelfth Table" ((Selection E in *Apocalyptic Spirituality*), and "Commentary on an Unknown Prophecy" (*Visions of the End*, section 17, pp. 130-33); "The Joachite Movement before 1200" (*Visions of the End*, section 19, pp. 161-67); "Peter Olivi, *Commentary on Revelation*" (*Visions of the End*, section 24, pp. 208-11). Do not post quotations from McGinn's own introductions to the texts.

<u>Research assignment:</u> Make a presentation (last week and this week) offering a close reading of a key passage or passages from a primary source. You should have posted a copy of your passage on Blackboard by noon on October 8.



#### Week 9. October 22. Political apocalyptic in the later Middle Ages

With the turmoils of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, we frequently see apocalyptic language put to political use, as the excerpts in McGinn's *Visions of the End* will show. With Savonarola, the figure of the New Jerusalem becomes a goal to be realized in a reformed Florence. Is it "mere rhetoric" or a means of making sense of one's own world? We also will see the centrality of apocalyptic thought in the Columbus's voyages to the New World. How does this insight square with any mental picture you may already have of Columbus? Of the Renaissance? Of modernity?

Research: Getting a handle on historiography.

# Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

"Savonarola," in McGinn, Apocalyptic Spirituality, 183-275;

McGinn, *Visions of the End*, sections 30 (Political Prophecies: French versus German Imperial Legends), 33 (Germany of the Eve of the Reformation);

Pauline Moffitt Watts, "Prophecy and Discovery: On the Spiritual Origins of Christopher Columbus's 'Enterprise of the Indies," *American Historical Review* 90, no. 1 (1985): 73-102 (ER);

Columbus, *Book of Prophecies*, letter to Ferdinand and Isabella (at pp. 105-11, odd numbers) (ER).

Graduate students should also read: Mayte T. Green-Mercado, "The Mahdi in Valencia: Messianism, Apocalypticism and Morisco Rebellions in Late Sixteenth-Century Spain," *Medieval Encounters* 19 (2013): 193-220.

<u>Discussion assignment</u>: This week's discussion assignment will make use of Blackboard's discussion board. Choose one quotation or passage from each of the primary texts listed below that you would like to discuss with the class. Post your quotation (please include page numbers), along with a brief (1-2 sentence) explanation of why you chose that particular passage or quotation. Texts for which to choose quotations: Savonarola's *Compendium of Revelations*; McGinn's *Visions of the End*, sections 30 and 33 (do not choose a quotation from McGinn's introductions); and Columbus's letter to Ferdinand and Isabella. Feel free to bring in insights from Watts's article. All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, October 21.

Research assignment: Submit on Blackboard a properly formatted bibliography listing the most important scholarship (secondary sources) on your topic. Submissions are due by noon on October 21. Your bibliography should include at least seven entries at this point, of which at least two should be scholarly monographs (a book-length study published by an academic press) and at least three should be articles from peer-reviewed journals or edited volumes. Explain in a few sentences how your research will contribute to the scholarly conversation. (See "Getting a Handle on Historiography" posted on Blackboard under Papers and Assignments for more explanation.) You will present your thoughts on the historiography on your topic to the class this week and next.



# Week 10. October 29. Apocalypticism and modern nations: the special place of America

The settlers who came to the British colonies in North America brought with them an apocalyptic sense (not unlike Savonarola's conception for Florence) that they were creating the New Jerusalem in New England. Apocalypticism remained a potent force in the consciousness of the new nation. We sample two American apocalyptic movements this week: the Millerites and the Mormons (both of which have their origins not far from Rochester!). As you read, ask yourself what is distinctly American here, what distinctly modern, and what is familiar from patristic, medieval, and early modern traditions.

Research: Getting a handle on historiography, continued.

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Weber, Apocalypses, 167-191.

Wayne R. Judd, "William Miller: Failed Prophet," in Ronald Numbers and Jonathan Butler, eds., *The Disappointed: Millerism and Millenarianism in the Nineteenth Century* (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1993), 17-35 (ER);

William Miller, "Prophetic Chronology," excerpts, in Joshua V. Himes, ed., *Miller's Works. Vol. 1. Views of the Prophetics and Prophetic Chronology* (Boston: Joshua V. Himes, 1842), 40-51 (ER);

John G. Turner, *The Mormon Jesus: A Biography*, ch 5 ("I Come Quickly"), 121-51 (ER);

The Pearl of Great Price, excerpts from the section entitled Joseph Smith—History (<a href="http://www.sacred-texts.com/mor/pgp/">http://www.sacred-texts.com/mor/pgp/</a>) (ER).

Optional: Leon Festinger, Henry Riecken, and Stanley Schachter, *When Prophecy Fails* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1956), online at http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015004283084;view=1up;seq=11;

and, for an example from nineteenth-century France, R. Hermon-Belot, "God's Will in History: The Abbé Grégoire, the Revolution and the Jews," in *Catholic Millenarianism: From Savonarola to the Abbé Gregoire*, ed. Karl A. Kottman, Millenarianism and Messianism in Early Modern European Culture, 2 (Dordrecht and Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001), 91-100 (ER).

<u>Discussion assignment</u>: Comment on Judd, Miller, Turner, and *Pearl*, using Perusall. Post at least two comments, questions, or replies to others on each of the readings. Feel free to bring in insights from Weber. All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, October 28.

<u>Research assignment:</u> Present your findings about the historiography on your topic to the class (this week and last week). You should have submitted a bibliography and explanation by noon on October 21.



#### Week 11. November 5. No class: research and writing time; individual conferences

Research: Schedule an individual conference with the instructor for some time this week.



Historiography paper must be submitted to Blackboard by 11:59 p.m. on Friday, November 9. See Assignments and Papers on Blackboard for detailed instructions.



Week 12. November 12. Apocalypse in twentieth- and twenty-first-century America

We sample a fundamental text in the strain of eschatological interpretation known as dispensational premillennialism this week in Hal Lindsey's classic *The Late, Great Planet Earth*, a book that has informed political interpretations of contemporary events since its first publication in 1970. We are reminded of the potential dangers of the ignorance of apocalyptic language by revisiting the tragedy of the Branch Davidians in Waco, Texas, in 1994. And Ammon Bundy's revival of the White Horse Prophecy points to the way in which apocalyptic readings of current events still have the power to move people.

Research: Presenting and proving a thesis: lightning round.

#### Reading for discussion (please read in the order listed):

Weber, Apocalypses, 193-222;

Hal Lindsey, *The Late Great Planet Earth* (New York: Zondervan, 1970) at least chapters 1, 4-8, 11-13;

Malcolm Gladwell, "Annals of Religion. Sacred and Profane: How Not to Negotiate with Believers," *The New Yorker*, March 31, 2014, 22-28 (ER);

Betsy Gaines Quammen, "COVID-19 and the White Horse Prophecy: The Theology of Ammon Bundy," History News Network, May 10, 2020, <a href="https://historynewsnetwork.org/article/175390">https://historynewsnetwork.org/article/175390</a> (ER).

<u>Discussion assignment:</u> This week's discussion assignment will make use of Blackboard's discussion board. Choose two quotations or passages from *Late, Great Planet Earth* and one each from the articles by Gladwell and Quammen. Post your quotation (please include page numbers), along with a brief (1-2 sentence) explanation of why you chose that particular passage or quotation on Blackboard. Feel free to bring in insights from Weber. All posts are due by 11:59 p.m. on Wednesday, November 11.

Research assignment: You will make a very brief, five-minute presentation outlining the argument you will pose in your paper and showing some of the ways in which you will prove your thesis using primary sources. This is a trial run for the paper draft, so don't make a presentation "in search of a thesis," i.e., laying out all the neat things you found without making a clear argument. Think about logical structures and ways of presenting evidence.



Complete draft of your paper must be made available to your peer readers via Blackboard by November 15 at 11:59 pm.



Week 13. November 19. Workshop on drafts

This week will be devoted to a peer-review workshop for your paper drafts. See Blackboard (Assignments and Papers) for detailed instructions.



Students should schedule an individual conference with the instructor to discuss the paper draft at some time between the November 19 workshop and December 10.



Week 14. November 26. Thanksgiving Day (no class)



Week 15. December 3. Final presentations (via Zoom)

This week is devoted to presentations of your research projects. See Blackboard (Assignments and Papers) for detailed instructions.



Final papers due on December 18, by noon, via Blackboard.

Undergraduate papers should be at least 5000 words in length (body only, not including notes and bibliography); graduate student papers should be of publishable length (6250-10,000 words) and quality. Papers should be submitted in Times or Times New Roman font, 12 point, double-spaced, with standard margins. You may use footnotes or endnotes, but whichever you choose you MUST follow University of Chicago style (Turabian/humanities style) for text and references. Include a bibliography, separated into primary and secondary sources, at the end of your paper. See Assignments and Papers on Blackboard for more details about the final paper.



## Learning objectives:

At the end of this course, students will be able to

- Read and understand primary sources as products of a specific historical context
- Identify the elements of the literary genre apocalypse

- Outline major developments in the history of apocalyptic thought from the intertestamental period through the twentieth century
- Provide examples of the way in which apocalyptic thinking responds to current events and can be used either to propel action or to support the status quo
- Identify the thesis and analyze the argument of secondary sources relating to apocalyptic thinking
- Present historical analysis and arguments in a clear written form, by constructing an argument and marshaling supporting evidence in an appropriate and logical fashion.
- Write a research paper that asks a significant historical question, situates it within a
  body of scholarship, answers it with a clear thesis and a logical argument, supports it
  with both primary and secondary sources documented according to the standards of
  the Chicago Manual of Style, and articulates its points in clear and artful prose with
  the grammar and spelling associated with formal composition.

#### Books to purchase:

#### Recommended:

The New Oxford Annotated Bible with Apocrypha: New Revised Standard Version, ed. Michael D. Coogan, Marc Z. Brettler, et al. (paperback), 5<sup>th</sup> ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018). ISBN: 978-0190276089

# Required:

Hal Lindsey, *The Late Great Planet Earth* (New York: Zondervan, 1970). ISBN: 9780310277712

Bernard McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality* (New York: Paulist Press, 1979). ISBN: 9780809122424

Bernard McGinn, Visions of the End: Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages, revised ed. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998). ISBN: 978-0231112574

Eugen Weber, Apocalypses: Prophecies, Cults, and Millennial Beliefs through the Ages (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999). ISBN: 9780674003958

<u>Electronic Reserves (ER)</u>: Readings designated (ER) in the syllabus are linked through Blackboard.

**Statement regarding credit hours:** The College's credit hour policy on undergraduate courses is to award 4 credit hours for courses that meet for the equivalent of 3 periods of 50 minutes each week. Students enrolled in HIS 382W are expected to devote at least one hour each week to researching in depth the topics for their final papers.

#### Course requirements:

Discussion assignments----10%

Participation in discussions (in person, via Zoom, or online asynchronously)----5%

Write your own apocalypse, with commentary/book review—10%

Research prospectus----10%

Research assignments----10%

Historiography paper----15%

Final research paper----35%

Draft/workshop on drafts---5%

Reading assignments are due on the day they appear in the lecture schedule (with the obvious exception of the first day of class, for which the reading may be done after class).

Attendance at and participation in all classes—whether in person, via Zoom, or online asynchronously—is crucial to your success in this course. Repeated absences will affect your grade.

Late work will be penalized 5% for each calendar day late. Failure to post discussion assignments by the required time may result in a full loss of credit for that assignment.

#### Grading scale:

100-93%
92.9-90%
89.9-87%
86.9-83%
82.9-80%
79.9-77%
76.9-73%
72.9-70%
69.9-67%
66.9-63%
62.9-60%
Below 60%

In case of some mix-up, it is a good idea to save all returned work until you receive your grade at the end of the semester.

Students with disabilities: The University of Rochester respects and welcomes students of all backgrounds and abilities. In the event you encounter any barrier(s) to full participation in this course due to the impact of disability, please contact the Office of Disability Resources. The access coordinators in the Office of Disability Resources can meet with you to discuss the barriers you are experiencing and explain the eligibility process for establishing academic accommodations. You can reach the Office of Disability Resources at: <a href="mailto:disability@rochester.edu">disability@rochester.edu</a>; (585) 276-5075; Taylor Hall. If you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to contact me as well.

**Classroom etiquette:** For those participating in face-to-face classes, please turn off cell phones or set them to a silent alert. In the rare event you must enter late or leave class early, please let me know in advance. All students should disable or turn off all social media notifications during the class period.

**Academic honesty:** All assignments and activities associated with this course must be performed in accordance with the University of Rochester's Academic Honesty Policy. Cheating and plagiarism are serious offenses and will be treated as such. Anyone who

engages in such activities will be turned over to the College Board on Academic Honesty for disciplinary action, as outlined at <a href="http://www.rochester.edu/College/honesty/">http://www.rochester.edu/College/honesty/</a>. For helpful discussions of plagiarism (including subtle, unintentional instances), see the American Historical Association's "Defining Plagiarism," <a href="https://www.historians.org/teaching-and-learning/teaching-resources-for-historians/plagiarism-curricular-materials-for-history-instructors/defining-plagiarism">https://www.historians.org/teaching-and-learning/teaching-plagiarism</a>.

University of Rochester COVID-19 regulations: The University is committed to protecting the health and safety of the entire community – students, faculty and staff. For this reason, it is mandatory that everyone wear a mask in University buildings and observe appropriate social distancing, including classrooms. Masks have been provided to students, faculty and staff and classrooms have been specifically assigned to allow for social distancing to support these requirements. You must wear a mask appropriately (e.g. over nose and mouth) if you are attending class in person, and you must do this for every class session and for the entire duration of each class session. If you fail to do this, you will be politely reminded of the requirement and then asked to leave if you do not comply.

If you do not want to wear a mask, you may consider taking the course remotely (online). This may require you to complete a set of online requirements different from the in-person requirements, although these will be equivalent in their learning objectives.

Students who refuse to adhere to requirement for mask wearing or social distancing the course will be in violation of the COVID-19 Community Commitment and will be referred to the Student Conduct system through a COVID-19 Concern Report. Such referrals will lead to student conduct hearings and may result in disciplinary action.

Students who feel unable to wear a mask may contact the Office of Disability Resources to explore options for accommodations. Students requiring accommodations may be asked to participate in the course through synchronous or asynchronous learning as part of this accommodation.

**Copyright notice:** Copyright © by Laura Smoller as to this syllabus and any in-class lectures.

**Disclaimer:** The instructor reserves the right to change topics and assignments on the syllabus at any point in the semester. Any changes will be announced in class and posted on Blackboard.